

‘Climate for Change’

Gender Equality and Climate Policy

**Final Report
of the
City of Frankfurt am Main, Germany**

July 2004

STADT  **FRANKFURT AM MAIN**
Dezernat Bildung, Umwelt und Frauen

CITY OF FRANKFURT AM MAIN, GERMANY
Department of Education, Environment and Women

1. Introduction

Frankfurt am Main – Metropolis in the Centre of Europe

Located in the centre of Germany, Frankfurt am Main has a population of approximately 650,000. Frankfurt's economy is not only characterised by its role as a banking centre [European Central Bank, Deutsche Bundesbank (German Central Bank), numerous banks and savings institutions] and home to the Frankfurt Airport as well as the Messe Frankfurt exhibition grounds and conference centre, but the city is also an important site for the chemicals industry. Frankfurt boasts many places and buildings belonging to Germany's cultural heritage, including the place of coronation for the German emperors and the first German Parliament, and has been one of Germany's key trading centres since the Middle Ages.

In the electricity sector, energy is supplied by three large thermal power plants (coal, natural gas, waste), which generate approx. 25% of the electricity consumed in Frankfurt. Another 3% of the required electricity is provided by almost 100 decentralised cogeneration plants. The overall electricity consumption amounts to 5000 GWh. The remaining electricity demand is purchased from external companies in the German integrated electricity grid. Thus, self-generated electricity from cogeneration plants is a main focus in Frankfurt.

In regards to the local power plants, 2004 will see a natural gas thermal power plant be converted into a highly efficient combined cycle plant, an industrial power plant equipped with a gas turbine and a wood-fired thermal power plant installed at a chemicals company. In the heating sector, primarily natural gas (approx. 60 %) and heating oil (40 %) are used. Natural gas pipes run underneath almost all streets in Frankfurt. The total annual emission of greenhouse gas CO₂ amounts to approx. 7.5 million tons.

Climate Protection Activities

Department of Energy

In 1989/1990, the City of Frankfurt became a founding member of the Climate Alliance. In 1990, the **Department of Energy**, with currently 9 employees, was established within the Department of Environment as a municipal climate protection and energy agency.

Its tasks include:

- development and implementation of Frankfurt's climate protection concept,
- preparation and implementation of energy concepts for individual objects and city areas,
- conducting environmental impact studies for construction projects,
- undertaking and organising energy consulting services and activities in the broadest sense, and
- monitoring the *Energieverbrauchskennzeichnungsgesetz* (German Energy Consumption Labelling Act).

Since 1990, energy projects have been proposed, discussed and implemented with numerous partners (energy suppliers, trade and industry, environmental associations, private households). There is a wide range of informational brochures, events and public relations. Main focuses include electricity efficiency in office buildings, combined heat and power generation (cogeneration plants) for new and old housing and building areas, housing stock modernisation, promotion of low energy and passive houses as well as solar energy systems and wood heating.

The Department of Energy co-ordinates numerous issues regarding climate protection relevant decisions with other municipal authorities, such as the Department of Urban Planning, Department of Urban Development, Road Construction Authority and Central Office (Procurement Agency).

Moreover, extensive co-operation and co-ordination is maintained with energy providers Mainova AG (75% subsidiary of the City of Frankfurt) and SÜWAG-MKW. Together with its partners, Frankfurt participated in the European "In town without my car!" action day, which takes place annually on 22 September. The deployment of 90 cogeneration plants alone has led to a CO₂ reduction of 70,000 t/year.

On a European level, the Department of Energy has participated in projects for establishing energy agencies and the "REST" project for renewable energies in the tourism sector; it is a leading partner in the "Greeneffect" project for the efficient use of electricity and the procurement of "green electricity" in office buildings and, together with the City of Frankfurt's Department of Women, participates in the "Climate for Change" — Climate Protection and Gender Mainstreaming project.

Municipal Building Department / Energy Management Agency

20 years ago, the Energy Office was established in the Municipal Building Department (Building Department), in the meantime it has been converted to the **Energy Management Agency** with 5 employees.

Its tasks include:

- planning and implementation of energy-saving construction measures for municipal buildings,
- energy management,
- monitoring and supervision of energy and water consumption,
- processing of energy supply contracts, invoice controlling, operation optimisation, and
- organisation of training courses for employees in municipal buildings as well as the user profit-sharing programme.

Together with the Department of Energy, the Energy Management Agency participates in the "DISPLAY" EU project for the display of information on the CO₂ and energy performance of municipal buildings open to the public. Since 1990, the CO₂ reduction for municipal buildings amounts to 60,000 t/year (30%).

Activities in Regards to Gender-related Issues

The City of Frankfurt has distributed the tasks of promoting women and assuring equal opportunities amongst two organisational units. On the one hand, the co-ordinating women's commissioners and internal women's commissioners work towards the equality of women within the municipal authorities in accordance with the Hessian Equal Rights Act. On the other hand, the Department of Women works in compliance with the Hessian Municipal Code and represents the interests of Frankfurt's female citizens.

Co-ordinating Women's Commissioners and Internal Women's Commissioners

In Frankfurt/Main, there are two full-time appointed, equal **co-ordinating women's commissioners**. They are responsible for all cross-departmental activities aimed at promoting equal opportunities. Two women employees assist them in their tasks.

They undertake fundamental, cross-cutting and co-ordinating tasks for the development and promotion of equal treatment within the municipal authorities.

They participate in, e.g., the following measures:

- preparation of the affirmative action plan for women,
- reporting on the affirmative action plan for women,
- introduction of new public management models,
- cross-departmental organisational and personnel changes,
- job advertisements, selection procedures for office and departmental management staff,
- development of new work time models,
- personnel development concept,
- co-ordination, consulting and further training/continuing education of local women's commissioners, and the
- Committee for the Advancement of Women.

Local women's commissioners are decentralised and present at all departments and companies of the municipal authorities. They

- monitor compliance with the affirmative action plan for women and submit suggestions with respect to its implementation,
- participate in the formulation of job advertisements, in selection procedures and job interviews,
- have to be consulted in questions of personnel management and development,
- can be members of steering committees and administrative reform working groups, and
- are represented in the Committee for the Advancement of Women.

The following tools for promoting equal opportunities are utilised:

- Hessisches Gleichberechtigungsgesetz (HGlG) (*Hessian Equal Rights Act*) of 1993, valid until 2006
- Affirmative Action Plan for Women (*City Council Assembly*) Resolution § 3851, dated 23-02-1995)

The Department of Women

The Department of Women in the City of Frankfurt was established in 1989, since, as stipulated in the Hessian Municipal Code, the realisation of equal rights and equal treatment is also a municipal task. The **Department of Women**

- develops women and gender policy concepts,
- represents the interests of women and girls,
- is a service point for women and girls and arranges contact to other specialised advice centres and administrative authorities,
- supports the women policy infrastructure of Frankfurt,
- co-operates and networks with other municipal authorities, regional and supraregional contact points and facilities, and
- makes the public aware of women and gender policy topics.

The main focuses of the Department of Women include reducing violence against women, labour market policies, education, young women's and girls' issues, culture, sports, urban planning and urban development. Already at the beginning of 2002, the Department of Women was provided with the personnel framework for initiating and supporting the gender

mainstreaming process in Frankfurt. These tasks are carried out in close co-operation with the city's co-ordinating women's commissioners.

With Resolution § 3459 dated 29-08-2002, the City Council resolved that "the City of Frankfurt...(will) henceforth implement the gender mainstreaming principle as a central component on all political and administrative levels." (see Appendix)

On the initiative of the City of Frankfurt and in co-operation with the City of Copenhagen/Denmark, the "Sister Cities Going Gender" joint project was conceptualised together with the cities of Vienna/Austria, Rotterdam/Netherlands, Rome/Italy, Venice/Italy and Turin/Italy as well as the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR) as implementation and co-funding partners. A joint application submitted to the EU Commission for project funding was approved in 2003.

Since the beginning of 2002, the Department of Women has examined and tested the application and effects of the gender mainstreaming principle within the scope of the European Union's EQUAL project MARE. The Department's tasks in this project include initiation and supervision of the gender mainstreaming process. The project is organised as a development partnership, with the participation of 2 cities (Frankfurt and Offenbach, Germany), two districts (Offenbach and Main-Taunus) as well as several private institutions.

In co-operation with the Department of Personnel and Organisation and the co-ordinating women's commissioners and in close co-ordination with the Department of Women, corresponding kick-off and informational meetings will be held in 2004 for the departmental heads of the City of Frankfurt.

Starting in autumn 2004, the application of GM in the various sectors should be tested in practice within the scope of at least one GM model project in each department's sphere of responsibility.

2. Women in Decision-making Positions Relevant to Climate Protection: Quantitative Data

Frankfurt

		Total	Proportion of Women
Political and Policy Sector	City Council Assembly	87	37
	Municipal Authorities	10	2
Administration	1 st and 2 nd Level	187	55
Total Number of Employees		12,189	6,513

Climate Protection Relevant Departments

		Total	Proportion of Women
Political and Policy Sector	Environmental Committee	15	3

	Traffic and Transportation Committee	20	6
	Planning and Construction	20	6
Administration	1 st and 2 nd Level	2	-
Total Number of Employees		14	1

Relevant Agencies And Companies

		Total	Proportion of Women
Total Number of Employees	Chimney Sweep Guild, Mainova (relevant departments)	368	42

3. Women in Decision-making Positions Relevant to Climate Protection: Framework Conditions and Opinions

In April/May 2004, the following persons were interviewed: the co-ordinating women's commissioners as well as the women's commissioners of the Environment Office and the Department of Energy of the City of Frankfurt, the City Councillor for Women and the Environment Department of the City Of Frankfurt, the superintendent of the Rhine-Main Chimney Sweep Guild, the departmental heads of the Municipal Building Department and the Department of Energy of the City of Frankfurt, a management board member at Mainova AG Frankfurt as well as a female architect and a female energy consultant.

3.1 Applied Affirmative Action Measures for Women

3.1.1 Affirmative Action Measures for Women within the Frankfurt Municipal Authorities

Implementation of Affirmative Action Plan for Women / Increasing the Proportion of Women in Areas of Underrepresentation

The foundation for the equal opportunities policy within the departments of the Frankfurt Municipal Authority is the affirmative action plan for women, which is based on the Hessian Equal Rights Act. The objectives it formulates in regards to the desired proportion of women in certain sectors as well as the principle of hiring equally qualified women applicants are the key control elements for eliminating/reducing the underrepresentation of women in those work areas (or salary brackets).

The City of Frankfurt utilises a fine-meshed network of women's commissioners: besides the cross-departmental co-ordinating women's commissioners, 'local' women's commissioners work in all departments and companies of the municipal authorities and monitor/promote compliance with the contents of the affirmative action plan for women. Participation in the job hiring process starts with the formulation of the job advertisements and announcements, includes the right to supplement the list of applicants to be invited for a job interview and culminates in a decision-making function when selecting candidates; in case of conflict, the women's commissioners have the right to appeal.

Recruiting Candidates

From the perspective of the affirmative action for women, proactive advertising for applications from women is viewed as a key measure for increasing their proportion among applicants; in addition to public announcements and advertisements in the specialised and trade press, measures include approaching professional networks for women, such as the Ingenieurinnen-Bund (*German Association of Women Engineers*).

Continuing Education

The continuing education catalogue provides a variety of courses specifically for women; e.g., a seminar with the title 'Appetite for Management?' is offered that prepares women for undertaking managerial and executive tasks.

Balancing Family and Career / Part-time Employment (Family Support)

In the City of Frankfurt, all employees can opt for part-time employment. In some areas, there is the additional option of working part-time from home (home office / telecommuting).

Mentoring

The Frankfurt Municipal Authorities do not have a mentoring system.

3.1.2 Affirmative Action Measures for Women Outside of the Frankfurt Municipal Authorities

The other companies included in the interviews do not have any specific measures explicitly aimed at the internal promotion and advancement of women.

A particular obstacle in the **chimney sweep trade** lies in the fact that part-time employment is virtually non-existent due to the company structure — the entire business is comprised of the owner and journeyman.

By means of appealing presentations made by female members within the scope of career days at schools or via brochures, the guild is making efforts to encourage young women to apply. There are no additional specific measures — in part due to financial restrictions as well.

There are no specific measures for increasing the proportion of women at **Mainova** either. Here, approx. 5% of the employees work part-time, 124 women (88%) among them. To accommodate female employees, telecommuting workplaces were established for the first time two years ago. Up to now, requests for part-time employment have not been denied. With its participation in the Frankfurt Girls' Day, during which 15 girls and young women visited the power plant this year, Mainova is making a social contribution.

3.2 Obstacles to Increasing the Proportion of Women

Continued Hiring Freezes

The staffing restrictions applying to all departments of the Frankfurt Municipal Authorities have made new hirings a non-issue: new hires and replacements for vacating staff are only possible if the pertinent authority proves the absolute necessity (task evaluation) and require the approval of the Personnel Department. In the very rare cases of approved hirings, vacant positions are first internally announced by the Personal Placement Office of the municipal authorities; initial checks are conducted to determine whether the municipality's internal job pool offers applicants with suitable profiles, so that the chances of external applications are comparatively low.

An additional reinforcement for this change-resistant dynamic results from the fact that authorities and departments also avoid internal job announcements due to the not unjustified fear that jobs and job fillings — e.g. because of problems within the scope of the selection and hiring process — might be abolished, thus leading to a significant reduction in personnel capacity for the respective sector. Examples of this were presented.

Application Situation

The application situation, with a low proportion of female applicants, is viewed as a general obstacle to hiring women in technical-scientific fields. From the perspective of the promotion and advancement of women, proactive advertising measures encourage women to apply for such positions. Due to the lack of personnel fluctuation, however, this measure is also not very effective at present.

Applicant Selection Procedure

For the women's commissioner employed at the municipal authorities, participation in the selection procedure is restricted.

Part-time Employment in Management/Executive Positions

According to the affirmative action plan for women, part-time employment should be promoted both on the whole and in management and executive positions. Partially due to the

cost-saving aspects, part-time employment is readily approved. However, part-time employment in management and executive positions is a rare exception.

Hierarchies / Lack of Access to Continuing Education Programmes

As described, the continuing education catalogue of the Frankfurt Municipal Authorities provides a variety of offers specifically for women — some of them aimed at preparing women for management and executive positions. However, since participation is subject to approval, these offers are not accessible to everybody who, e.g., has an 'Appetite for Management'.

Lack of/Insufficient Childcare Options

In regards to childcare options, which play a central role as a prerequisite for the employment of persons with caretaking duties — thus in particular for women — the emphasis lies in the shortage of day nurseries, the lack of fixed lesson times at primary schools and all-day schools and not enough spaces available at after-school care centres. While nursery schools do provide a reliable framework for working parents, it is particularly the early school years, with their fewer number of lessons on the whole and irregular timetables, which represent a difficult-to-overcome obstacle to continued employment.

Views / Attitudes

In addition to, or maybe even more important than, the comparatively low proportion of female applicants in technical-scientific fields and for management and executive positions are the serious obstacles created by the attitude towards women in these work areas.

In principle, the interviewed department heads directly or indirectly affirmed these statements about women in the technical-scientific sector.

Quite a few recent examples illustrate the fact that this attitude has persevered over time. Among other things, one interview partner identified the natural genetic make-up of women as the root of their underrepresentation in technical-scientific sectors.

3.3 Differences between Women and Men in Regards to Climate Protection and Work Forms

Equal Participation of Women in Climate Protection

When asked about the relevance of equal participation of men and women in climate protection, the reactions and responses of the interview partners varied greatly. One interview partner was outright surprised.

It is especially the *female* interview partners who take a different stance towards this: several women said that since the participation of women was important *in all regards*, participation in this field was important as well. Here it was assumed that women would expand the range of included aspects. Among other things, it was mentioned that women make climate-relevant decisions in everyday life, such as selecting the means of transportation (e.g. for family holidays) or deciding on consumer goods (refrigerator). Therefore, the women's commissioners assume that the increased involvement of women would broaden the content of the cross-cutting climate protection topic and that the quality of the decisions made by the relevant bodies and committees would improve.

Different Priorities

The question concerning the different priorities set by men and women in the climate protection area were answered in the same vein. While 2 interview partners do not see any differ-

ences in regards to the professional treatment of the topic, all other interview partners perceive distinct differences in the way men and women approach climate protection: a more technical approach is attributed to men, whereas women are more associated with an integrative concept of preserving generations, conserving resources and promoting sustainability. In particular, women are said to take a stronger view of, or even initially bring to the discussion, ideas of environmental education, consultation and training.

Working in Gender-homogeneous or Gender-heterogeneous Groups — Preferences

Provided that the question concerning the preference of working in gender-homogeneous or gender-heterogeneous groups is not met with indifference, the majority of the interviewees prefer working in mixed gender groups, stating that, amongst other things, decisions should be made in a dialogue between men and women.

One female interview partner takes a special point of view by clearly preferring to work solely with women, saying that she has had only good experiences with this in her more than 20-year-long professional career.

Differences Between Women and Men in Regards to Climate Protection and Work Forms

The question as to the differences in work forms — such as a stronger consensus-oriented approach, enhanced communication skills or flat hierarchies on the part of women — clearly displays a general tendency to ascribe to women stronger competencies when it comes to co-operation.

Parenthood is considered a suitable criterion for distinguishing team players from hierarchically-oriented persons, since the competencies gained there also extend into professional life.

Women in management and executive positions are not only associated with good experiences. The differentiation between 'parent / non-parent' arises from the efforts to explain this fact.

3.4 Measures for Increasing the Proportion of Women

Change of Attitudes

Several interview partners see a change in attitudes and everyday practices as a prerequisite for increasing the proportion of women in the climate protection area.

Part-time Employment in Management and Executive Positions

In order to increase the attractiveness of management and executive positions for women (especially those with childcare duties), managerial tasks can be shared. This requires significant organisational efforts, but should be feasible.

Perceiving Climate Protection as Cross-cutting Task

Climate protection comprises a wide spectrum of tasks, ranging from communication/presentations to business/marketing up to environmental education, to name a few. The emphasis on technical aspects is possibly attributable to a male-dominated perspective, both in terms of cause and effect. This applies to management and executive positions in this area as well, or even in particular, that job announcements do not have to necessarily focus on technical aspects.

Inquire about Social and Leadership Competencies

Particularly when announcing vacancies for management and executive positions, social competencies should be asked about and demonstrated; this increases the chances for women and is a prerequisite for others to follow suit.

Offer/Boost Popularity of Role Models/Introduce Mentoring

Certain reinforcing processes triggered by same-gender role models have an effect on both genders. Therefore, role models — also historical ones — and female mentors are essential elements for promoting women. Thus mentoring should also be implemented in the structure of the municipal authorities. Women's professional networks seeking out historical role models have to be supported.

Demand Transparency of Selection Procedures and Communication of Criteria

Understandable and transparent criteria are a prerequisite for making decisions based on qualifications, demanding objective decisions and involving women's commissioners.

Transferring Knowledge from Private Enterprises to Public Authorities

Private enterprises are increasingly realising that women often possess modern management competencies. Much could be gained if this realisation would become manifest in public authorities.

4. Brief Evaluation of Results and Initial Suggestions

This study has corroborated the thesis of the underrepresentation of women in climate protection: women are clearly underrepresented or even totally absent in fields of work relevant to climate protection. This particularly applies to work areas requiring technical degrees, such as a degree in physics or engineering in the mechanical, electrical or heat engineering fields. Specific measures aimed at the internal promotion and advancement of women are only implemented within the Frankfurt Municipal Authorities. The affirmative action plans for women prepared in compliance with the Hessian Equal Rights Act have only a limited impact considering the current hiring freeze. Job openings, if there are any, are first internally announced or directly filled by way of internal promotion.

Undisclosed criteria in regards to required qualifications in application and recruitment procedures constitute an additional impairment to the effectiveness of affirmative action plans for women and the participation of the women's commissioners. A clear and transparent formulation of the job profile should be a mandatory component of each personnel decision-making process.

Another starting point for increasing the recruitment of women in fields of work relevant to climate protection lies in the wording of the job advertisements and announcements. When climate protection is perceived as a cross-cutting task, tasks related to communication, marketing or environmental education grow in importance, along with the technical aspects. This applies to management and executive positions in this area as well, or even in particular, that job announcements do not have to necessarily focus on technical aspects. The chances for an increased participation of women in management and executive positions also increase if requirements regarding social competencies are explicitly inquired about and/or properly formulated.

Continuing education measures that encourage women to undertake management and executive tasks or prepare them to do so do not have much impact if they are denied to interested women. Access has to be made easier, e.g. by clearly formulating rights and decision-making criteria.

The divisibility of management and executive positions should not only be explicitly mentioned and emphasised in job advertisements and announcements: personnel decision-makers must also be provided with targeted information and made aware of the issues — if necessary, through training measures.

Since the presence of women in technical jobs or management and executive positions is far from being an everyday phenomenon, acceptance of them is still underdeveloped and role models and support are scarce, the introduction of a mentoring system appears to be a practical and useful addition to the affirmative action plan for women.

Another obstacle to the professional development of women is a lack and shortage of childcare options. Therefore, measures have to be initiated/promoted here as well, e.g. in the area of company childcare facilities or offers for relieving the burden on families.

In addition to roadblocks to change that are attributable to external framework conditions, such as a stagnating job market or lack of/insufficient childcare options, traditional thought patterns present a further obstacle to the increased involvement of women in climate protection.

The opinions and viewpoints of the interviewed persons display significant differences between gender-sensitive and gender-insensitive persons, thus demonstrating the possible benefit of awareness-raising measures. What is needed is a change in attitudes and values — amongst other things, in the sense of a company culture that emphasises "soft skills", e.g. by providing information about the fact that numerous US companies only hire management and executive staff with personnel responsibilities if applicants can prove that they have independently provided for a child over a period of at least one year or took care of an old, sick or disabled person.